Judge Hellerstein

06 CV

2892

Andrew J. Scholz (AS-7950) FLEMMING ZULACK WILLIAMSON ZAUDERER LLP One Liberty Plaza New York, New York 10006-1404 (212) 412-9500

Attorneys for Defendant World Trade Center Properties LLC

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

ALBERTO ACEVEDO, et al,

Plaintiffs,

- against
NOTICE OF REMOVAL

Defendants.

TO: THE HONORABLE JUDGES OF THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1441(a), 1442(a)(1), 1446(b) and the Air Transportation Safety and System Stabilization Act, Public Law No. 107-42, §401 et seq., as amended, 115 Stat. 230 (2001) (the "Act"), defendant the World Trade Center Properties LLC ("WTCP") hereby removes to the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York the action entitled Alberto Acevedo, et al., v. 1 World Trade Center LLC, et al., Index No. 102341/06, now pending in the Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of New York. The pertinent facts that establish the grounds for removal are as follows:

1. Upon information and belief, on or about February 16, 2006, plaintiffs commenced an action in the Supreme Court of the State of New York seeking damages for personal injuries, including respiratory and pulmonary injuries, allegedly sustained while

engaged in the emergency rescue, recovery, debris removal and clean-up of the destroyed World Trade Center buildings, including the sifting, removing, transporting and/or disposing of the debris of such buildings that were destroyed by the terrorist-related aircraft crashes of September 11, 2001. A copy of the Summons with Notice is annexed as Exhibit A.

Removal Is Authorized By 28 U.S.C. § 1441(a) and the Act

2. The United States District Court for the Southern District of New York has original and exclusive jurisdiction over this action. Congress, in section 408(b) of the Act, enacted a broad jurisdictional provision centralizing the resolution of all claims resulting from or relating to the terrorist related aircraft crashes of September 11, 2001 in the Southern District of New York:

(b) Federal cause of action.--

- (1) Availability of action.—There shall exist a Federal cause of action for damages <u>arising out of</u> the hijacking and subsequent crashes of American Airlines flights 11 and 77, and United Airlines flights 93 and 175, on September 11, 2001. . . . [T]his cause of action shall be the <u>exclusive</u> remedy for damages arising out of the hijacking and subsequent crashes of such flights.
- (3) Jurisdiction.—The United States District Court for the Southern District of New York shall have <u>original and exclusive jurisdiction</u> over all actions brought for <u>any claim</u> (including any claim for loss of property, personal injury, or death) <u>resulting from or relating to</u> the terrorist-related aircraft crashes of September 11, 2001.

Act § 408(b)(1) and (b)(3), 49 U.S.C. § 40101 (as amended) (emphasis added).

3. On July 14, 2005, the Second Circuit Court of Appeals held that plaintiffs who allege that they suffered injuries at the World Trade Center disaster site while sifting, removing, transporting and/or disposing of World Trade Center debris may only state, if at all, a federal cause of action under the Act which must be adjudicated exclusively in the Southern

District. See In re: WTC Disaster Site Litig., 414 F.3d 352, 2005 WL 1649041 (2d Cir. 2005) (a copy of which is attached as Exhibit B).

4. Accordingly, since plaintiffs' allegations can only state, if at all, a federal cause of action under the Act, the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York has exclusive jurisdiction to adjudicate the instant lawsuit.

Removal Is Also Warranted By 28 U.S.C. § 1442(a)(1)

- 5. Removal of this action is also authorized by the federal officer jurisdiction provision in 28 U.S.C. § 1442(a)(1) which provides that
 - (a) A civil action . . . commenced in a State court against any of the following may be removed by them to the district court of the United States for the district and division embracing the place wherein it is pending:
 - (1) The United States or any agency thereof or any officer (or any person acting under that officer) of the United States or of any agency thereof, sued in an official or individual capacity for any act under color of such office

(Emphasis added.)

6. During all times that plaintiffs allege they performed emergency disasterresponse efforts at the World Trade Center disaster site, the United States through federal
agencies, including the Occupational Safety and Health Administration ("OSHA"), was active at
the World Trade Center disaster site, inter alia, with respect to all aspects of the emergency
debris removal. Thousands of federal employees were deployed there to deal with the ongoing
public health and safety emergency. Specifically, public records show that with respect to the
safety of persons entering the World Trade Center site, "[r]ight after the attacks numerous
government agencies such as the Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA),
National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health (NIOSH), within the Department of Health
and Human Services (HHS), EPA, and State and City agencies dispatched representatives to the

[World Trade Center] site to . . . establish appropriate safety measures and protocols." <u>See</u>

Statement of Marianne Jackson, Deputy Federal Coordinating Officer for the Federal Emergency Management Agency for the World Trade Center Disaster, February 11, 2002, submitted to a Senate Subcommittee, a copy of which is attached as Exhibit C. This statement is also available at http://epw.senate.gov/107th/Jackson_021102.htm.

- T. Stafford Disaster Relief and Emergency Assistance Act, as amended by Pub. L. 103-181, Pub. L. 103-337, and Pub. L. 106-390,October 30, 2000, 114 Stat. 1552 1575) "federal personnel and teams deployed into the disaster area . . . arrived with the necessary protective gear." Id. Thereafter, "[s]ome 3,500 Federal workers were deployed to New York to support the disaster response, about 1,300 from FEMA, and almost 2,000 from other Federal departments and agencies." Id Among these federal workers were OSHA employees: "OSHA responded immediately to the September 11 terrorist attacks at the World Trade Center". See Responding To Disaster by Bill Wright, at 17, a copy of which is attached as Exhibit D. This article is also available at http://www.osha.gov/as/opa/911/pg17-23-jshq-v13-1-fall2001.pdf. Patricia Clark, OSHA's Regional Administrator in New York states that "OSHA ensured that all workers had access to safety and personal protective equipment..." Id.
- 8. OSHA directly undertook to "safeguard the health and safety of the recovery workers." See "Inside the Green Line: OSHA Responds To Disaster," at 5, a copy of which is attached as Exhibit E. This publication is also available at http://www.osha.gov/Publications/osha3189.pdf. Taking a leadership role, OSHA developed health and safety plans that addressed various disaster-related hazards, including, but not limited

to, those involving cranes, falls and falling objects, heavy equipment, explosions, hot steel, Freon and personal protective equipment. Id.

- 9. The foregoing establishes defendant's "colorable" defense of federal official immunity (federal agencies and officers exercised control over worker safety issues at the disaster site and, therefore, a causal nexus exists between plaintiff's worker safety claims at the disaster site and the alleged acts and omissions of the defendants). As such, federal courts have jurisdiction under federal officer subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1442(a)(1). As a result, federal jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1442(a)(1) exists so that the Port Authority may adjudicate this federal immunity defense in federal court.
- 10. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1446, a copy of this Notice of Removal is being filed with the Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of New York.
- 11. Pursuant to Rule 81.1(b) of the Local Civil Rules of the United States

 District for the Southern District of New York, within 20 days of the filing of the Notice of

 Removal, WTCP will file with the Clerk of this Court a copy of all records and proceedings in
 the state court.
 - 12. WTCP reserves the right to amend or supplement this Notice of Removal.

WHEREFORE, WTCP hereby removes the above-referenced action now pending against it in the Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of New York to this Court.

Dated: New York, New York April 12, 2006

FLEMMING ZULACK WILLIAMSON ZAUDERER LLP

y: May I Sold Iz (AS)

One Liberty Plaza New York, New York 10006-1404 (212) 412-9500

Attorneys for Defendant World Trade Center Properties LLC

281365

-X

ALBERTO ACEVEDO, STEVEN ADELHELM, LUIS ADRIANO, JOHN AKOS, KURT ALBERTSON, NICHOLAS ALEXAKIS, MAYSAM ALJADER, RICHARD ALVAREZ, ALBERTO ANDRADE, ROBERT ANDREWS, MIKE ANNUNZIATE, CARMINE ANTONIELLO, JOSE AQUINO, ARTURO ARIAS, GUILLERMO ARRUBLA, STEVEN AUERBACH, COLIN AUSTIN, MICHAEL BADAGLIACCA, JASON BAHRT, DAVID BARHER, MICHAEL BARNABLE, BENITO BARREIRO. MICHAEL BARRY, JOHN BASIL, MICHAEL BASSANO, JOHN BELL, JOSEPH BELLOMO, JOHN BERARDI, ELIZABETH BERBERICH, CHRISTOPHER BERGMANN, ANGEL BERNABE, ROBERT BERRIOS, DARREN BILLENBECK, BARRY BLANCHARD, KEITH BOBE, RONALD BOCCHICHIO, JOHN BOLAND, JOHN BOMHOFF, ANTHONY BONANNO, MILTON BONILLA, WILLIAM BORAVES, HENRY BORAWSKI, WIKTOR BOROWIECKI, MELBA BOYLES, KEVIN BRADLEY, EDWARD BRAUN, HERMANN BRAUN, ALFRED BRELAND, CHRISTOPHER BRIECKE, ANA BROGAN, TANYA BROOKS, RAYMOND BRYAN, STEVEN BRYSON, GEORGE BUONOCORE, MICHAEL BURNS, CALVIN BURTON, JOANNE BUTLER, TYRONE BUTLER, GEORGE BUTRICO, JOHN CAHILL, SCOTT CALANDRA, STEVEN CALLAHAN, MARYANN CAMARDA, MATTHEW CAMERA, ANDREW CAMIOLO, FRANK CAMPBELL, KENNETH CAMPBELL, JAMES CAMUS, JOHN CANGIARELLA, SALVATORE CANTONE, LOUIS CAPUANO, RUDOLPH CAROLEO AND LORETTA A CAROLEO, WARREN CARTWRIGHT, JOHN CASSIDY, BIENVENIDO CASTILLO, PAUL CASTRO, DANTE CASTRO-RECIO, MICHAEL CHAMPION, JEAN CHARLOT. CARLOS CHAVEZ, HAN CHOI, STEVE CIRONE, CHRIS CLARK, GEORGE CLARK, PAUL CLAUS, ROBERT CLENDENNING, MICHAEL COADY, JESSICA COCCODRILLI, ROBERT COCCODRILLI, WILLIAM COCCODRILLI, MORRIS COFIELD, BENJAMIN COLECCHIA, THOMAS COLL, ANGELO CONETTA, ROBERT J CONKLIN, DANIEL CONWAY. JAMES CORCORAN, GEORGE COREY AND JEANETTE COREY, FREDERICK CORRUBIA, DAVID CORTES, JANELLE COSTELLO, JOHN COUSINS, ANTHONY CROCE, JAMES CRONIN,

1 of 24

SUMMONS WITH NOTICE

Index No: 102341/06

FFB - 2 2006

CUADRADO, OH 02892 Akt Daciment Filed 04/12/06 Page 9 of 31 CUOZZO, KATHLEEN CURNYN, JOSEPH CUSUMANO, JOSEPH D'ANGELO, GARY D'AUDREA, JOSEPH DE ROSA, FIDEL DE VIVO. JAMES DEADY, MICHAEL DEFILIPPS, DENNIS DELLAVALLE, ROBERT DELPRETE, NICHOLAS DELUCA, FRANK DEMATTEO, WILLIAM DEMENT. CHRISTOPHER DEMURO, JOSEPH DENT, RICHARD DEPIETRO, CONRAD DEPINTO, DANIEL DEWITT. JULIO DIAZ, MICHAEL DIETERICH, DAVID DIMMLER, NICHOLAS DINATAEL, CHRIS DIRUSSO, FRANCIS DISCOLO, JOSEPH DOHERTY. MICHAEL DOLAN, FRANK DOLCE, HENRY DOSKOCZ, JOHN DOWNEY, GENNE DUBELBEISS, DEREK K. DUNSTON, ANA DURAN, ROBERT ECHEVERRIA, STEVEN ECKERT, KEITH EDWARDS, MICHAEL EDWARDS, ANNMARIE ENNIS, ANTONY FABBRI, MICHAEL FAGAN. JOSEPH FAILLA, VINCENT FALSITTA, MICHAEL FELICE, JEFFREY FERNANDEZ, MICHAEL FERRADO, JOSEPH FERRARO, JOSEPH FERRIOLO, ALBERT FERRO, KEITH FESTA, DAMIEN FILS-AIME, THOMAS FINNEGAN, JOHN FITZPATRICK. SALVATORE FIUMEFREDDO, SAMUEL FONTANEZ, JEFFREY FOSELLO, JEFFREY FREIFELD, GARY FREITAG, ROBERT FUREY, STEPHEN GADRY, PARAMJIT GAKHAL, FRANK GALIA, FRANK GATO, THOMAS GEE, GEORGE GEORGIADIS, RANDOLPH GIL, DANIEL GLATZ, LAURENCE GOLDBERG, DAVID GOLEMBIOWSKI AND JESSICA GOLEMBIOSKI, LUIS GOMEZ, MOISES GOMEZ, MICHAEL GONSIESKI, ANTHONY GORDON, RONALD GORDON, JAMES GRAF, MICHELLE GRANICK, ANTHONY GRAVANO, YANTI GREENE, AARON GREENSTEIN, LAWRENCE GREGG, GREGORY GUARNERI. MICHAEL GUARNIERI, PETER GUASTAMACCHIA AND MARIA GUASTAMACCHIA, PETER GUELLA, LISA GUERRIERO, STEPHEN GUGLIELMO, ALBERT GUT, WILLIAM GUTCH, JUAN GUZMAN, JULIAN HAMPDEN, STEVEN HANLY, MAHENDRA HARIPERSAUD, JEFF HAWER, ANTHONY HEINLEIN, CARLOS HERNANDEZ, ROBERT HIBBINS, REGINALD HILAIRE, DEREK HOLLOWAY, DEXTER HONORA, MICHAEL HONOVICH, CRAIG HOO, EMMETT CHOSKINS. MIRANDELLE HOUANCHE, ELLIOT HOUSTON, JAMES IOVINO, BRIAN ISAACS, DANIEL JACKSON, EDMUND JACKSON, CHRISTOPHER JACOBELLIS, BRIAN JACOBSEN, MICHAEL

JARRATT, ROBERT JERSEY, KRISTOPHER JEZSEK, Filed 04/12/06 Page 10 of 31 CARLOS JIMENEZ, ALFRED JOHNSON, GARY JOHNSON, KAMEEL JUMAN, DANIEL KAPPOCK, JOHN KASSIMATIS AND ALEXANDRA KASSIMATIS, THOMAS KAUFER, ROBERT KEANE, RICHARD KEITH, TERESA KEITH, RAYMOND KELLER, MARY ANN KELLY - CORBETT, PATRICK KENNEDY, SCOTT KENNEDY, STEVEN KENNEDY, STEPHEN KEOWN, PAUL KERRIGAN, ELLIOT KLINBORSKY, LINDA KNORPP, MICHAEL KORABEL, KENYETTA KORNEGAY - PICHARDO. JOHN KOSTER, DEAN KOWALSKI, ROBERT KREISS, ROBERT KURKOWSKI, ROY KURZ, THOMAS KWASNAZA, NICHOLAS LABOY, LEONARDO LAGO-CAMBEIRO, JUAN LAM, PAMELA LAMBRIGHT, TOYA LANE, ANTHONY LATACZ, GEORGE LATIMER, MAIRA LEWIS, . SHARON LITROFF, STEVEN LOMBARDI, JOHN LOMICKY, THOMAS LOOMIS, PEDRO LOPEZ. RONALD LOWE, RICHARD LUCIFERO, THOMAS LUGO, SALVATORE LUMIA, WILLIAM LUONGO, ANTHONY LUSTICA, THOMAS LYNCH, JOHN LYONS, KEVIN MADDEN, MICHAEL MAGENHEIM, DENNIS MAIRA, MARGARET MAKOC, MARIANA MALDONADO, JENNY MAMI, EDWIN MANGUAL, RAYMOND MANISCALLO, GARY MANNINA, SCOTT MANNINO, JEAN MANSFIELD, DONNA MARSHALL, CHRISTOPHER MARSKI, HECTOR MARTINEZ, MICHAEL MASSARO, GRACIE MASSENBURG, CHRISTOPHER MATHUS, MARK MAUCERI, BRANT MAYNARD, LEE MAZKLOWE. BRIAN MCALLISTER, JEFFREY MCCABE, WILLIAM MCCABE, EVERETT MCCAIN, GREGORY MCCORMICK, RICHARD MCCUSKER, GERARD MCDADE, WILLIAM MCLEE, SEAN MCNICHOLS, DAVID MEDINA, VICTOR MELE, JAVIER MELENDEZ, SALVATORE MESSINA, FADILA METANOVIC, LEONARD MILLER, MARCELLO MILONE, DENNIS MITCHELL, BRANDON MOHR AND CHRISTINE MOHR, BRIAN MONACELLI, CARMINE MONELLO, PHILIP MONGIOVI, JOHN MONTALBANO AND CONSTANCE MONTALBANO. PETER MONTGOMERY, DELVIS MORALES, PETER MORAN, PETER MORRIS, RAHIM MORRIS, SCOTT MORRISSEY, MILENA MORYC-DZIUBEK, RICHARD MUELLER, ROBERT MULLIGAN, WILFRED MUNOZ, MICHAEL MURPHY, SHAWN MURPHY, WILLIAM MURRAY, RICHARD NAPOLITANO. KENNETH NASH, PAUL NEAL, WILLIAM NEDOS. JULIO NEGRON, GEORGE NELLSON, JENNY-ANN

SLOAN, WILLIAM SLOWSKI, CHRIS SMITH, GODFREY SMITH, WAYNE SMITH, JOHN

TARPEY, RICHARD TAYLOR, ROBERT

GEORGE TULLY, MICHAEL TURCHIANO.

SPILLANE, ROBERT ST. CLAIR, PETER STANISICH, KEVIN STEELE, JOHN SULLIVAN AND ROSA M SULLIVAN, MARK TAFFE, ANA TAHA, PEDRO TAMAYO AND GABRIELLA TAMAYO, DANIEL

THOMPSON, BRIAN P TIERNEY, BRIAN TOOHEY, ERICK TORRES, MOSES TORRES, RUBIN TORRES,

JENNIFER URENA, STEPHEN VACZZOLA, ANTONIO VALENTIN, HECTOR VARGAS, CECILIA

Case 1:06-cv-02892-AKH - Document 1 Filed 04/12/06 Page 12 of 31 EDGARDO VAZQUEZ, EDGAR VILLANUEVA, LAVERN WATSON, THOMAS WEBER, EVAN WEINBERG, KEITH WELZ, CHRISTOPHER WENDT. DAWN WESTCOTT, PETER WESTCOTT, GARY WHITE, PATRICK WHITE, OLIVER WHITES, LINDA WHITLEY-WARREN, ROBERT WIBREN, DIANE WILLIAMS, RUDOLPH WILLIAMS, STEPHEN WILLIAMS, BRENDAN WINKLE, MICHAEL WITTMAN, MICHAEL WOHN, CLARENCE WRAGG, RICHARD A WRIGHT, RONALD YATES, BRIAN YONKER, WILLIAM YOUNG, DEREK YUENGLING, MARYELLEN YUREK, AS PERSONAL REPRESENTATIVE OF THE ESTATE OF STEPHEN YUREK, AND MARYELLEN YUREK INDIVIDUALLY, KENNETH ZACHAR, ALEJANERO ZAPATA, SUSAN ZAPOLUCH, JOHN ZARNOWSKI. JOHN ZULTANKY,

Plaintiff(s),

-against-

1 WORLD TRADE CENTER LLC; 1 WTC HOLDINGS LLC; 2 WORLD TRADE CENTER LLC.: 2 WTC HOLDINGS LLC.; 4 WORLD TRADE CENTER LLC.; 4 WTC HOLDING LLC.; 5 WORLD TRADE CENTER LLC.; 5 WTC HOLDING LLC.; A RUSSO WRECKING, INC.; ABM; ABM INDUSTRIES, INC.; ABM JANITORIAL NORTHEAST, INC.; AMEC CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT, INC.; AMEC EARTH & ENVORONMENTAL, INC., ANTHONY CORTESE SPECIALIZED HAULING LLC.; ATLANTIC HEYDT CORP.; BECHTEL CONSTRUCTION, INC.; BECHTEL CORPORATION; BECHTEL ENVIRONMENTAL, INC.; BERKEL & COMPANY, CONTRACTORS, INC.; BFP. Tower C Co. LLC; BIG APPLE WRECKING & CONSTRUCTION CORP; BOSTON PROPERTIES; BOVIS LEND LEASE LMB, INC.; BOVIS LEND LEASE, INC.; BREEZE CARTING CORP.; BREEZE NATIONAL INC.; BRER-FOUR TRANSPORTATION CORP.; BURO HAPPOLD CONSULTING ENGINEERS, P.C.; C & D FIREPROOFING & PLASTERING CORP.; C.B. CONTRACTING CORP; CANRON CONSTRUCTION CORP., CANTOR SEINUK GROUP, CERTIFIED FENCE CORP.; CIVETTA-COUSINS JV, L.L.C.; CLARCOR AIR FILTRATION PRODUCTS, INC.; COMPONENT ASSEMBLY SYSTEMS, INC.; CONSOLIDATED EDISON COMMUNICATIONS HOLDING COMPANY, INC.: CONSOLIDATED EDISON COMPANY OF NEW YORK, INC.; CONSOLIDATED EDISON

ENERGY, 1:06; CONSOLIDATED POSSIBLE 1 Filed 04/12/06 Page 13 of 31 SOLUTIONS, INC.; CONSOLIDATED EDISON, INC.; COORDINATED METALS, INC.; CORD CONTRACTING CO., INC.; CRAIG TEST BORING COMPANY INC.; CRITICOM INTERNATIONAL CORPORATION; CUSHMAN & WAKEFIELD, INC. D'ONOFRIO GENERAL CONTRACTORS CORP.: DAKOTA DEMO-TECH, INC.; DCM ERECTORS, INC.; DIAMOND POINT EXCAVATING CORP.; DIEGO CONSTRUCTION, INC.; DIVERSIFIED CARTING, INC.; DMT ENTERPRISE, INC.; EAGLE LEASING & INDUSTRIAL SUPPLY, INC.; EAGLE ONE ROOFING CONTRACTORS INC; EAGLE SCAFFOLDING CO., INC.; EJ DAVIES, INC.; EN-TECH CORP.; ET ENVIRONMENTAL; EVERGREEN RECYCLING OF CORONA(EROC); EWELL W. FINLEY, P.C.: EXECUTIVE MEDICAL SERVICES, P.C.; F&G MECHANICAL, INC.; FELIX EQUITES, INC.; FLEET TRUCKING, INC.; FRANCIS A. LEE EXTERIOR RESTORATION, INC.; FRANK MICELLI JR.CONTRACTING, INC.; FTI TRUCKING, INC.; GILSANZ, MURRAY, & STEFICEK, LLP, GOLDSTEIN ASSOCIATES CONSULTING ENGINEERS, PLLC.; GRACE INDUSTRIES, INC.; HALLEN WELDING SERVICE, INC.: HELMSMAN MANAGEMENT SERVICES, INC.; HGC CONTRACTING CORP.; HIGH-RISE ELECTRIC, INC.: HIGH RISE HOISTING AND SCAFFOLDING, INC., JP EQUIPMENT RENTAL MATERIALS, INC; LAQUILA CONSTRUCTION INC.; LASTRADA GENERAL CONTRACTING CORP.; LESLIE E. ROBERTSON ASSOCIATES CONSULTING ENGINEERS P.C.; LIBERTY MUTUAL INSURANCE COMPANY; LIBERTY MUTUAL MANAGED CARE INC.; LOCKWOOD, KESSLER & BARTLETT, INC.; LUCIUS PITKIN, INC.; LZA TECH-DIV OF THORTON TOMASETTI; MANAFORT BROTHERS INCORPORATED; MAZZOCCHI WRECKING, INC., MEDCOR MENT BROS. IRON WORKS CO., INC., MERIDIAN CONSTRUCTION GROUP; MOODY'S INVESTORS SERVICE; MRA ENGINEERING, PC; MUESER RUTLEDGE CONSULTING ENGINEERS, INC, MUSCO SPORTS LIGHTING, LLC.; NACIREMA INDUSTRIES INCORPORATED; NEW YORK CRANE & EQUIPMENT CORP.;-NYC INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY; NICHOLSON CONSTRUCTION COMPANY; OLYMPIC PLUMBING & HEATING CORP.; OVE ARUP & PARTNERS P.C.; PARSON GROUP, INC.; PETER SCALAMANDRE & SONS, INC.; PINNACLE; PINNACLE ENVIRONMENTAL CORP.; PLAZA CONSTRUCTION CORP.; PLAZA CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT CORP.; PRO SAFETY SERVICES LLC.; PT & L CONTRACTING CORP.; REGIONAL SCAFFOLDING &

ROBERT ERRAT; ROBERT L. GEROSA, INC.; ROYAL GM, INC, SAB TRUCKING INC.; SAFEWAY ENVIRONMENTAL CORP.; SEASONS INDUSTRIAL CONTRACTING; SHELDRAKE ORGANIZATION, INC.; SILVERITE CONTRACTING CORPORATION; SILVERSTEIN DEVELOPMENT CORP; SILVERSTEIN PROPERTIES INC; SILVERSTEIN PROPERTIES; SILVERSTEIN WTC FACILITY MANAGER LLC.; SILVERSTEIN WTC LLC; SILVERSTEIN WTC MGMT CO. LLC.; SILVERSTEIN WTC PROPERTIES LLC.; SIMPSON GUMPERTZ & HEGER INC.; SKIDMORE, OWING & MERRILL LLP; STAR DELTA ELECTRIC, INC.; STIER ANDERSON, LLC.; SURVIVAIR; TISHMAN CONSTRUCTION CORPORATION OF MANHATTAN; TISHMAN CONSTRUCTION CORPORATION OF NEW YORK; TISHMAN SPEYER PROPERTIES; TOMASETTI GROUP, INC.; TORRETTA TRUCKING, INC.; TOTAL SAFETY CONSULTING, L.L.C.; TRIO ASBESTOS REMOVAL; TUCCI EQUIPMENT RENTAL CORP.; TULLY CONSTRUCTION CO., INC.; TULLY CONSTRUCTION COMPANY; TULLY ENVIRONMENTAL INC.; TULLY INDUSTRIES, INC.; TURNER CONSTRUCTION CO.; TURNER CONSTRUCTION COMPANY; TURNER CONSTRUCTION INTERNATIONAL, LLC.: ULTIMATE DEMOLITION/CS HAULING (JOINT VENTURE); UNITED STATES REBAR, INC; VOLLMER ASSOCIATES LLP.; W HARRIS & SONS INC.; WEEKS MARINE, INC.; WEIDLINGER ASSOCIATES, CONSULTING ENGINEERS, P.C.; WESTFIELD AMERICA, INC; WESTFIELD WTC HOLDING LLC; WESTFIELD WTC, LLC.; WFP Tower D. Co., LP; WHITNEY CONTRACTING INC.; WOLKOW-BRAKER ROOFING CORP.; WORLD TRADE CENTER PROPERTIES LLC.; YANNUZZI & SONS, INC; YONKERS CONTRACTING COMPANY, INC.; YORK HUNTER CONSTRUCTION, LLC; ZIEGENFUSS DRILLING, INC.,

To the above-named defendant(s):

You are hereby summoned and required to serve upon plaintiff's/plaintiffs' attorney, at the address stated below, a notice of appearance or demand for a complaint.

Defendant(s).

If this summons was personally delivered upon you in the State of New York, the answer must be served within twenty days after such service of the summons, excluding the date of service. If the summons was not personally delivered to you within the State of New York, the answer must be served within thirty days after service of the summons is complete as provided by law.

deems just and proper for exposure to toxic contaminants, including but not limited to: fumes, gasses, mists, vapors, dust, fibers, particles, substances, and/or radiation at or around the World Trade Center Site, Ground Zero, Fresh Kills Landfill, and/or in the area and buildings surrounding the World Trade Center Site following terrorist attacks on September 11, 2001. This exposure caused plaintiff's/plaintiffs' injuries, including but not limited to: acid reflux disease, asthma, Barrets Esophagus, bronchial inflammation, bronchitis, bullous disease of the lungs, cancer, chemical pneumonitis, chronic bronchitis, chronic cough, chronic laryngitis, chronic pneumonia, chronic rhinitis, chronic sinusitis, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD), emphysema, gastroesophageal disease (GERD), hearing loss, laryngitis, malignant mesothelioma, nasal polyps, neurological problems, peritonsillar cellulitis, pharyngitis, pneumonia, polyps on the larynx, polyps on the throat, reactive airway dysfunction syndrome (RADS), rhinitis, sarcoidosis, silicosis, sinus polyps, sinusitis, ulcerative colitis, vocal chord dysfunction, and exacerbation of a prior existing condition or conditions.

Your action(s) and/or failure to act, constitutes carelessness, negligence and/or recklessness, and is the sole and proximate cause of plaintiff's/plaintiffs' toxic exposure, and resulting injuries, illnesses and damages.

Your failure and/or the failure of your agents, servants, representatives and/or employees to comply with, including but not limited to, the following: General Municipal Law of the State of New York §205-e and §205-a; the Occupational Safety and Health Act, 29 U.S.C. §§ 654 et seq.; Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA) standards, including but not limited to, 29 C.F.R. §1910 Subparts H, I, J, K and Z, and specifically 29 C.F.R. §§1910.38, 1910.120, 1910.132-134, 1910.146, 1910.156, 1910.1001, 1910.1025, 1910.1027, 1910.1000 and 1910.1200; 29 C.F.R. §1926 Subparts C, D, E, F, G, H, I, J and Z; The New York Industrial Code, including but not limited to: §§23-1.5, 23-1.7, 23-1.8, 23-1.9, 23-1.25, 23-1.26 and 23-2.1; New York State Labor Law, including but not limited to: §§200, 240, 241(6), Article 2, §27-a, Article 28; 12 N.Y.C.R.R. §820.4; and other applicable Federal, State and local rules, regulations, ordinances and statutes is the proximate cause of plaintiff's/plaintiffs' injuries, toxic exposure and resulting damages.

If you do not serve a notice of appearance or demand for a complaint within the applicable time limitation stated above, a judgment may be entered against you, by default, for a sum greater than the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts, with interest, and the costs and disbursements of this action.

The action will be heard in the Supreme Court of the State of New York, in and for the County of New York. The basis of venue is N.Y. C.P.L.R. §509.

Dated: New York, New York February 16, 2006

Christopher R. LoPalo Attorney for Plaintiff

WORBY GRONER EDELMAN & NAPOLI BERN, LLP

115 Broadway, 12th Floor

8 of 24

ALBERTO ACEVEDO, STEVEN ADELHELM. LUIS ADRIANO, JOHN AKOS, KURT ALBERTSON, NICHOLAS ALEXAKIS, MAYSAM ALJADER, RICHARD ALVAREZ, ALBERTO ANDRADE, ROBERT ANDREWS. MIKE ANNUNZIATE, CARMINE ANTONIELLO, JOSE AQUINO, ARTURO ARIAS, GUILLERMO ARRUBLA, STEVEN AUERBACH, COLIN AUSTIN, MICHAEL BADAGLIACCA, JASON BAHRT, DAVID BARHER, MICHAEL BARNABLE, BENITO BARREIRO, MICHAEL BARRY, JOHN BASIL, MICHAEL BASSANO, JOHN BELL, JOSEPH BELLOMO, JOHN BERARDI, ELIZABETH BERBERICH, CHRISTOPHER BERGMANN, ANGEL BERNABE, ROBERT BERRIOS. DARREN BILLENBECK, BARRY BLANCHARD, KEITH BOBE, RONALD BOCCHICHIO, JOHN BOLAND, JOHN BOMHOFF, ANTHONY BONANNO, MILTON BONILLA, WILLIAM BORAVES, HENRY BORAWSKI, WIKTOR BOROWIECKI, MELBA BOYLES, KEVIN BRADLEY, EDWARD BRAUN, HERMANN BRAUN, ALFRED BRELAND, CHRISTOPHER BRIECKE, ANA BROGAN, TANYA BROOKS, RAYMOND BRYAN, STEVEN BRYSON, GEORGE BUONOCORE, MICHAEL BURNS, CALVIN BURTON, JOANNE BUTLER, TYRONE BUTLER, GEORGE BUTRICO, JOHN CAHILL, SCOTT CALANDRA, STEVEN CALLAHAN. MARYANN CAMARDA, MATTHEW CAMERA, ANDREW CAMIOLO, FRANK CAMPBELL, KENNETH CAMPBELL, JAMES CAMUS, JOHN CANGIARELLA, SALVATORE CANTONE, LOUIS CAPUANO, RUDOLPH CAROLEO AND LORETTA A CAROLEO. WARREN CARTWRIGHT, JOHN CASSIDY, BIENVENIDO CASTILLO, PAUL CASTRO, DANTE CASTRO-RECIO, MICHAEL CHAMPION, JEAN CHARLOT, CARLOS CHAVEZ, HAN CHOI, STEVE CIRONE, CHRIS CLARK, GEORGE CLARK, PAUL CLAUS, ROBERT CLENDENNING, MICHAEL COADY. JESSICA COCCODRILLI, ROBERT COCCODRILLI, WILLIAM COCCODRILLI, MORRIS COFIELD, BENJAMIN COLECCHIA. THOMAS COLL, ANGELO CONETTA. ROBERT J CONKLIN, DANIEL CONWAY. JAMES CORCORAN, GEORGE COREY AND

CRONIN, KEVIN CROWLEY, EDWIN CRUZ, YOLANDO CUADRADO, JOHNNY CUEVAS, ANGELO CUOZZO, KATHLEEN CURNYN, JOSEPH CUSUMANO, JOSEPH D'ANGELO, GARY D'AUDREA, JOSEPH DE ROSA, FIDEL DE VIVO, JAMES DEADY, MICHAEL DEFILIPPS, DENNIS DELLAVALLE, ROBERT DELPRETE, NICHOLAS DELUCA, FRANK DEMATTEO, WILLIAM DEMENT. CHRISTOPHER DEMURO, JOSEPH DENT, RICHARD DEPIETRO, CONRAD DEPINTO. DANIEL DEWITT, JULIO DIAZ, MICHAEL DIETERICH, DAVID DIMMLER, NICHOLAS DINATAEL, CHRIS DIRUSSO, FRANCIS DISCOLO, JOSEPH DOHERTY, MICHAEL DOLAN, FRANK DOLCE, HENRY DOSKOCZ, JOHN DOWNEY, GENNE DUBELBEISS. DEREK K. DUNSTON, ANA DURAN, ROBERT ECHEVERRIA, STEVEN ECKERT, KEITH EDWARDS, MICHAEL EDWARDS, ANNMARIE ENNIS, ANTONY FABBRI. MICHAEL FAGAN, JOSEPH FAILLA, VINCENT FALSITTA, MICHAEL FELICE. JEFFREY FERNANDEZ, MICHAEL FERRADO, JOSEPH FERRARO, JOSEPH FERRIOLO, ALBERT FERRO, KEITH FESTA. DAMIEN FILS-AIME, THOMAS FINNEGAN. JOHN FITZPATRICK, SALVATORE FIUMEFREDDO, SAMUEL FONTANEZ, JEFFREY FOSELLO, JEFFREY FREIFELD. GARY FREITAG, ROBERT FUREY, STEPHEN GADRY, PARAMJIT GAKHAL, FRANK GALIA, FRANK GATO, THOMAS GEE. GEORGE GEORGIADIS, RANDOLPH GIL. DANIEL GLATZ, LAURENCE GOLDBERG. DAVID GOLEMBIOWSKI AND JESSICA GOLEMBIOSKI, LUIS GOMEZ, MOISES GOMEZ, MICHAEL GONSIESKI, ANTHONY GORDON, RONALD GORDON, JAMES GRAF. MICHELLE GRANICK, ANTHONY GRAVANO, YANTI GREENE, AARON GREENSTEIN, LAWRENCE GREGG. GREGORY GUARNERI, MICHAEL GUARNIERI, PETER GUASTAMACCHIA AND MARIA GUASTAMACCHIA, PETER GUELLA. LISA GUERRIERO, STEPHEN GUGLIELMO. ALBERT GUT, WILLIAM GUTCH, JUAN GUZMAN, JULIAN HAMPDEN, STEVEN HANLY, MAHENDRA HARIPERSAUD, JEFF HAWER, ANTHONY HEINLEIN, CARLOS

HONORACYIORACEIO PROVINCIA DRAYMENT 1 Filed 04/12/06 Page 19 of 31 HOO, EMMETT C HOSKINS, MIRANDELLE HOUANCHE, ELLIOT HOUSTON, JAMES IOVINO, BRIAN ISAACS, DANIEL JACKSON, EDMUND JACKSON, CHRISTOPHER JACOBELLIS, BRIAN JACOBSEN, MICHAEL JANNAZZO, MANUEL JARAMILLO, HERVEY JARRATT, ROBERT JERSEY, KRISTOPHER JEZSEK, CARLOS JIMENEZ, ALFRED JOHNSON, GARY JOHNSON, KAMEEL JUMAN, DANIEL KAPPOCK, JOHN KASSIMATIS AND ALEXANDRA KASSIMATIS, THOMAS KAUFER, ROBERT KEANE, RICHARD KEITH, TERESA KEITH, RAYMOND KELLER, MARY ANN KELLY -CORBETT, PATRICK KENNEDY, SCOTT KENNEDY, STEVEN KENNEDY, STEPHEN KEOWN, PAUL KERRIGAN, ELLIOT KLINBORSKY, LINDA KNORPP, MICHAEL KORABEL, KENYETTA KORNEGAY -PICHARDO, JOHN KOSTER, DEAN KOWALSKI, ROBERT KREISS, ROBERT KURKOWSKI, ROY KURZ, THOMAS KWASNAZA, NICHOLAS LABOY, LEONARDO LAGO-CAMBEIRO, JUAN LAM. PAMELA LAMBRIGHT, TOYA LANE, ANTHONY LATACZ, GEORGE LATIMER. MAIRA LEWIS, SHARON LITROFF, STEVEN LOMBARDI, JOHN LOMICKY, THOMAS LOOMIS, PEDRO LOPEZ, RONALD LOWE, RICHARD LUCIFERO, THOMAS LUGO, SALVATORE LUMIA, WILLIAM LUONGO, ANTHONY LUSTICA, THOMAS LYNCH. JOHN LYONS, KEVIN MADDEN, MICHAEL MAGENHEIM, DENNIS MAIRA, MARGARET MAKOC, MARIANA MALDONADO, JENNY MAMI, EDWIN MANGUAL, RAYMOND MANISCALLO, GARY MANNINA, SCOTT MANNINO, JEAN MANSFIELD, DONNA MARSHALL, CHRISTOPHER MARSKI. HECTOR MARTINEZ, MICHAEL MASSARO, GRACIE MASSENBURG, CHRISTOPHER MATHUS, MARK MAUCERI, BRANT MAYNARD, LEE MAZKLOWE, BRIAN MCALLISTER, JEFFREY MCCABE, WILLIAM MCCABE, EVERETT MCCAIN, GREGORY MCCORMICK, RICHARD MCCUSKER, GERARD MCDADE, WILLIAM MCLEE, SEAN MCNICHOLS, DAVID MEDINA, VICTOR MELE, JAVIER MELENDEZ, SALVATORE

MESSINA, FADILA METANOVIC, LEONARD

CARMINE MONELLO, PHILIP MONGIOVI, JOHN MONTALBANO AND CONSTANCE MONTALBANO, PETER MONTGOMERY, DELVIS MORALES, PETER MORAN, PETER MORRIS, RAHIM MORRIS, SCOTT MORRISSEY, MILENA MORYC-DZIUBEK, RICHARD MUELLER, ROBERT MULLIGAN. WILFRED MUNOZ, MICHAEL MURPHY, SHAWN MURPHY, WILLIAM MURRAY, RICHARD NAPOLITANO, KENNETH NASH, PAUL NEAL, WILLIAM NEDOS, JULIO NEGRON, GEORGE NELLSON, JENNY-ANN NELSON, JOSEPH NELSON, DARON NESMITH, MARITZA NIEVES, MICHAEL NOONE, MICHAEL O'BRIEN, CATHERINE O'CONNOR, THOMAS O'DEA, PATRICK O'SHAUGHNESSY, RICHARD OAKLEY, JULIO OLIVENCIA, JOSEPH OPROMAILA, ELVA ORBE, LUIS ORSINI, VICTOR OTERO, NATHALIE PACIFICO, LUIS PADILLA, DREW PALMER, JOHN PAOLUCCI, JOEL PARADES, NICHOLAS PASQUAVELLO, REYNALDO PAULINO, ROB PAULSEN. THOMAS PEPE, ADRIAN PEREZ, IRMA PEREZ, RAMONITA PEREZ, YVONNE PEREZ, FRED PERLIN, ERNEST PHILLIPS, FRANK PICIULLO, BARRY PIKAARD, JOSEPH PIZZUTO, MICHAEL PLATE, PAUL POGOZELSKI AND KAREN POGOZELSKI, PIOTR POROWSKI, DAVID PROSCIA. DONALD PRZYBYSZEWSKI, SALVATORE PULIZZOTLO, AUOREY PUSINS, JAMES QUILTY, RAYMOND J RAGUSA, JOSE RAMOS, JOSEPH RANAURO, LAWRENCE RAND, JOSE RECIO, ROBERT REID, JOSEPH REILLY, KARYN RESKO, DAVID REVANS, DANIEL RIVERA, DANIEL RIVERA, GERALDO RIVERA, THOMAS ROBINSON. ANTHONY ROCCO, COLIN ROGERS. RICHARD ROJAS, THOMAS ROJECKI, JAMES ROLLINS, MIECZYSLAW ROMANIUK, JOHN ROMANO, VINCENZO ROMANO, LAURA ROMER, DALIA ROMERO, LISA ROSADO, RICHARD ROSADO, BRIAN ROSS, GIOVANNINA RUGGIERO, MARIE RUSS, PASQUALE RUSSO, DAVID SAGER, DANIEL SALSEDO, JEFF SALTA, LEONEL SANMARTIN AND ANA ROSA, MARTIN SANTIAGO, ZAVEN SAVA, JAMES SCHIRALDI, KEVIN SCHLITZ,

SESSO, ABREAIN OURS COSTO DE LA PRINTE DEL PRINTE DE LA PRINTE DEL PRINTE DE LA PRINTE DEL PRINTE DE LA PRINT GERALDO SILVA, THOMAS SILVA, JASON SIMONE, RICHARD SINGH, GEORGE SINOPIDIS, PETER SITRO, EUGENIUSZ SKRZECZKOWSKI AND ALICJA SKRZECZKOWSKI, MICHAEL SLOAN, PETER SLOAN, WILLIAM SLOWSKI, CHRIS SMITH, GODFREY SMITH, WAYNE SMITH, JOHN SPILLANE, ROBERT ST. CLAIR, PETER STANISICH, KEVIN STEELE, JOHN SULLIVAN AND ROSA M SULLIVAN, MARK TAFFE, ANA TAHA, PEDRO TAMAYO AND GABRIELLA TAMAYO, DANIEL TARPEY. RICHARD TAYLOR, ROBERT THOMPSON. BRIAN P TIERNEY, BRIAN TOOHEY, ERICK TORRES, MOSES TORRES, RUBIN TORRES. GEORGE TULLY, MICHAEL TURCHIANO, JENNIFER URENA, STEPHEN VACZZOLA, ANTONIO VALENTIN, HECTOR VARGAS, CECILIA VARICELLY, STEPHEN VASCONCELLOS, EDGARDO VAZOUEZ. EDGAR VILLANUEVA, LAVERN WATSON. THOMAS WEBER, EVAN WEINBERG, KEITH WELZ, CHRISTOPHER WENDT, DAWN WESTCOTT, PETER WESTCOTT, GARY WHITE, PATRICK WHITE, OLIVER WHITES. LINDA WHITLEY-WARREN, ROBERT WIBREN, DIANE WILLIAMS, RUDOLPH WILLIAMS, STEPHEN WILLIAMS, BRENDAN WINKLE, MICHAEL WITTMAN, MICHAEL WOHN, CLARENCE WRAGG, RICHARD A WRIGHT, RONALD YATES, BRIAN YONKER. WILLIAM YOUNG, DEREK YUENGLING. MARYELLEN YUREK, AS PERSONAL REPRESENTATIVE OF THE ESTATE OF STEPHEN YUREK, AND MARYELLEN YUREK INDIVIDUALLY, KENNETH ZACHAR, ALEJANERO ZAPATA, SUSAN ZAPOLUCH, JOHN ZARNOWSKI, JOHN ZULTANKY,

Plaintiffs,

-against-

1 WORLD TRADE CENTER LLC; 1 WTC HOLDINGS LLC; 2 WORLD TRADE CENTER LLC.; 2 WTC HOLDINGS LLC.; 4 WORLD TRADE CENTER LLC.; 4 WTC HOLDING LLC.; 5 WORLD TRADE CENTER LLC.; 5 WTC HOLDING LLC.; A RUSSO WRECKING, INC.; ABM;

ENVORONMENTAL, INC.; ANTHONY CORTESE SPECIALIZED HAULING LLC.; ATLANTIC HEYDT CORP.; BECHTEL CONSTRUCTION, INC.; BECHTEL CORPORATION; BECHTEL ENVIRONMENTAL, INC.; BERKEL & COMPANY, CONTRACTORS, INC.; BFP Tower C Co. LLC; BIG APPLE WRECKING & CONSTRUCTION CORP.; BOSTON PROPERTIES; BOVIS LEND LEASE LMB, INC.; BOVIS LEND LEASE, INC., BREEZE CARTING CORP.; BREEZE NATIONAL INC.; BRER-FOUR TRANSPORTATION CORP.; BURO HAPPOLD CONSULTING ENGINEERS, P.C., C & D FIREPROOFING & PLASTERING CORP.; C.B. CONTRACTING CORP; CANRON CONSTRUCTION CORP.; CANTOR SEINUK GROUP; CERTIFIED FENCE CORP.; CIVETTA-COUSINS JV, L.L.C.; CLARCOR AIR FILTRATION PRODUCTS, INC.; COMPONENT ASSEMBLY SYSTEMS, INC.; CONSOLIDATED EDISON COMMUNICATIONS HOLDING COMPANY, INC.; CONSOLIDATED EDISON COMPANY OF NEW YORK, INC.; CONSOLIDATED EDISON DEVELOPMENT, INC.; CONSOLIDATED EDISON ENERGY, INC.; CONSOLIDATED EDISON SOLUTIONS, INC.; CONSOLIDATED EDISON, INC.; COORDINATED METALS, INC.; CORD CONTRACTING CO., INC.; CRAIG TEST BORING COMPANY INC.; CRITICOM INTERNATIONAL CORPORATION; CUSHMAN & WAKEFIELD, INC; D'ONOFRIO GENERAL CONTRACTORS CORP.; DAKOTA DEMO-TECH, INC.; DCM ERECTORS, INC.; DIAMOND POINT EXCAVATING CORP.; DIEGO CONSTRUCTION, INC.; DIVERSIFIED CARTING, INC.; DMT ENTERPRISE, INC.; EAGLE LEASING & INDUSTRIAL SUPPLY, INC.; EAGLE ONE ROOFING CONTRACTORS INC: EAGLE SCAFFOLDING CO., INC.; EJ DAVIES, INC.; EN-TECH CORP.; ET ENVIRONMENTAL; EVERGREEN RECYCLING OF CORONA(EROC); EWELL W. FINLEY, P.C.; EXECUTIVE MEDICAL SERVICES, P.C.; F&G MECHANICAL, INC.; FELIX EQUITES, INC.; FLEET TRUCKING, INC.; FRANCIS A. LEE EXTERIOR RESTORATION, INC.; FRANK MICELLI JR.CONTRACTING, INC.: FTI TRUCKING, INC.; GILSANZ, MURRAY, & STEFICEK, LLP, GOLDSTEIN ASSOCIATES CONSULTING ENGINEERS, PLLC.; GRACE INDUSTRIES, INC.; HALLEN

SCAFFOLDING, INC.; JP EQUIPMENT RENTAL MATERIALS, INC; LAQUILA CONSTRUCTION INC.; LASTRADA GENERAL CONTRACTING CORP.; LESLIE E. ROBERTSON ASSOCIATES CONSULTING ENGINEERS P.C.; LIBERTY MUTUAL INSURANCE COMPANY; LIBERTY MUTUAL MANAGED CARE INC.; LOCKWOOD, KESSLER & BARTLETT, INC.; LUCIUS PITKIN, INC.; LZA TECH-DIV OF THORTON TOMASETTI; MANAFORT BROTHERS INCORPORATED; MAZZOCCHI WRECKING, INC.; MENT BROS. IRON WORKS CO., INC.; MERIDIAN CONSTRUCTION GROUP; MOODY'S INVESTORS SERVICE; MRA ENGINEERING, PC; MUESER RUTLEDGE CONSULTING ENGINEERS, INC; MUSCO SPORTS LIGHTING, LLC.; NACIREMA INDUSTRIES INCORPORATED; NEW YORK CRANE & EQUIPMENT CORP.; NYC INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY; NICHOLSON CONSTRUCTION COMPANY; OLYMPIC PLUMBING & HEATING CORP.; OVE ARUP & PARTNERS P.C.; PARSON GROUP, INC.; PETER SCALAMANDRE & SONS, INC.; PINNACLE: PINNACLE ENVIRONMENTAL CORP.; PLAZA CONSTRUCTION CORP.; PLAZA CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT CORP.; PRO SAFETY SERVICES LLC., PT & L CONTRACTING CORP.; REGIONAL SCAFFOLDING & HOISTING CO., INC.; ROBER SILMAN ASSOCIATES; ROBERT ERRAT: ROBERT L. GEROSA, INC.; ROYAL GM, INC: SAB TRUCKING INC.; SAFEWAY ENVIRONMENTAL CORP.; SEASONS INDUSTRIAL CONTRACTING; SHELDRAKE ORGANIZATION, INC.; SILVERITE CONTRACTING CORPORATION; SILVERSTEIN DEVELOPMENT CORP; SILVERSTEIN PROPERTIES INC; SILVERSTEIN PROPERTIES; SILVERSTEIN WTC FACILITY MANAGER LLC.; SILVERSTEIN WTC LLC: SILVERSTEIN WTC MGMT CO. LLC.; SILVERSTEIN WTC PROPERTIES LLC.; SIMPSON GUMPERTZ & HEGER INC.; SKIDMORE, OWING & MERRILL LLP; STAR DELTA ELECTRIC, INC.; STIER ANDERSON, LLC.; SURVIVAIR; TISHMAN CONSTRUCTION CORPORATION OF MANHATTAN; TISHMAN CONSTRUCTION CORPORATION OF NEW YORK; TISHMAN SPEYER PROPERTIES; TOMASETTI GROUP, INC.; TORRETTA TRUCKING, INC.; TOTAL SAFETY CONSULTING, L.L.C.; TRIO ASBESTOS REMOVAL; TUCCI EQUIPMENT RENTAL CORP.; TULLY CONSTRUCTION CO.,

Filed 04/12/06 Page 24 of 31

INDUSTRIES, ONEY, TERRER CONSTRUCTION CO.; TURNER CONSTRUCTION COMPANY; TURNER CONSTRUCTION INTERNATIONAL, LLC.; ULTIMATE DEMOLITION/CS HAULING (JOINT VENTURE); UNITED STATES REBAR, INC.; VOLLMER ASSOCIATES LLP.; W HARRIS & SONS INC.; WEEKS MARINE, INC.; WEIDLINGER ASSOCIATES, CONSULTING ENGINEERS, P.C.; WESTFIELD AMERICA, INC; WESTFIELD WTC HOLDING LLC; WESTFIELD WTC, LLC.; WFP Tower D. Co., LP; WHITNEY CONTRACTING INC.; WOLKOW-BRAKER ROOFING CORP.; WORLD TRADE CENTER PROPERTIES LLC.; YANNUZZI & SONS, INC, YONKERS CONTRACTING COMPANY, INC.; YORK HUNTER CONSTRUCTION, LLC; ZIEGENFUSS DRILLING, INC.,

Defendants.

X

530 Fifth Average 81F106-cv-02892-ANDPL Document 1 Filed 04/12/0 MARAGMENTO COLD New York, New York 10036 1726 FLATBUSH AVENUE 43 New Dorp Plaza BROOKLYN, NY 11210 Staten Island, NY 10014 1 WTC HOLDINGS LLC 530 Fifth Avenue-18 Floor EAGLE ONE ROOFING PRO SAFETY SERVICES, LLC New York, New York 10036 CONTRACTORS INC., c/o John Raucci 18-60 45th Street 2500 Westchester Avenue 120 Broadway Holding, LLC, Astoria, NY 11105 Purchase, NY 10577 C/O SILVERSTEIN PROPERTIES 530 FIFTH AVENUE-18TH FLOOR EAGLE SCAFFOLDING CO PT & L CONTRACTING CORP NEW YORK, NY 10036 67 Mill Street 1 Kalisa Way Ste 301 Amityville, NY 11701 Paramus, NJ 07652 2 WORLD TRADE CENTER LLC 530 Fifth Avenue-18 Floor EJ DAVIES, INC., REGIONAL SCAFFOLD & HOISTING New York, New York 10036 1837 Steinway Street CO, INC., Astoria, NY 11105 3900 Webster Avenue 2 WTC HOLDINGS LLC Bronx, NY 10470 530 Fifth Avenue-18 Floor EN-TECH CORP New York, New York 10036 C/O SACKS MONTGOMERY ROBER SILMAN ASSOCIATES Attn: Rick Rohn 88 University Place 4 WORLD TRADE CENTER LLC 800 Third Avenue New York, NY 10003 530 Fifth Avenue-18 Floor New York, NY 10022 New York, New York 10036 ROBERT L GEROSA, INC ET ENVIRONMENTAL 122 West Sheffield Avenue 4 WTC HOLDINGS LLC C/O CT CORPORATION SYSTEM Englewood, NJ 07631 530 Fifth Avenue-18 Floor 111 Eighth Avenue New York, New York 10036 New York, NY 10011 ROYAL GM INC., 112 Clarke Avenue 5 WORLD TRADE CENTER LLC EVERGREEN RECYCLING OF Staten Island, NY 10306 530 Fifth Avenue-18 Floor CORONA New York, New York 10036 127-50 Northern Blvd SAB TRUCKING INC. C/O SAVERIO ANASTASIO Flushing, NY 11368 5 WTC HOLDINGS LLC 7 Pironi Court 530 Fifth Avenue-18 Floor EWELL W. FINLEY, P.C., Woodbury, NY 11797 New York, New York 10036 34-18 Northern Boulevard Long Island City, NY 11101 SAFEWAY ENVIRONMENTAL CORP A RUSSO WRECKING 1379 Commerce Avenue 69 East Avenue EXECUTIVE MEDICAL SERVICES, Bronx, NY 10461 Lawrence, NY 11559 P.C., 15 Canal Road SEASONS INDUSTRIAL ABM INDUSTRIES, INC. Pelham Manor, NY 10803 CONTRACTING, 170 Hamilton Avenue 266 GREEN VALLEY RD WHITE PLAINS, NEW YORK 10601 F&G MECHANICAL, INC., STATEN ISLAND, NY 10312 348 New Country Road ABM JANITORIAL NORTHEAST, Secaucus, NJ 07094 SHELDRAKE ORGANIZATION, INC. INC. 80 N. Franklin Street 280 Trumbull Street, 22 Floor FELIX EQUITIES, INC. Hempstead, NY 11550 NEW YORK, HARTFORD, CT 06103 C/O MATT VERUILEN 202 Lovell Street SILVERITE CONTRACTORS AMEC CONSTRUCTION Lincolndale, NY 10540 520 Old Country Road MANAGEMENT, INC. Hicksville, NY 11801 1633 Broadway 24th Flr FLEET TRUCKING, INC. New York, NY 10019 SILVERSTEIN DEVELOPMENT 457 BLAKE AVENUE # 1 BROOKLYN, NY 11212 CORP.

18 of 24

FRANCIS A. LEE COMPANY, A

529 Fifth Avenue

New York, NY 10017-4608

AMEC EARTH &

ENVIRONMENTAL, INC.

ATLANTIC HEYDT CORP 1281 METROPOLITAN AVE BROOKLYN, NY 11237

BECHTEL CONSTRUCTION, INC., C/O CT CORPORATION SYSTEM 111 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10011

BECHTEL CORPORATION C/O CT CORPORATION SYSTEM 111 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10011

BECHTEL ENVIRONMENTAL. INC., C/O CT CORPORATION SYSTEM 111 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10011

BERKEL & COMPANY, CONTRACTORS, INC., C/O NATIONAL REGISTERED AGENTS, INC., 875 Avenue fo the Americas, Suite New York, NY 10001

BFP TOWER C CO. LLC. C/O UNITED CORPORATE SERVICES, INC. 10 BANK STREET, SUITE 560 WHITE PLAINS, NY 10606

BIG APPLE WRECKING & CONSTRUCTION CORP 1379 Commerce Avenue Bronx, NY 10461

BOVIS LEND LEASE LMB, INC. c/o Mound Cotton Wollan & Greengrass One Battery Park Plaza New York, NY 10004 Or-200 Park Avenue New York, NY 10166

BOVIS LEND LEASE, INC. c/o Mound Cotton Wollan & Greengrass One Battery Park Plaza New York, NY 10004 OrFRANCIS MICELLI JR CONTRACTING

FTI TRUCKING 14930 Powells Cove Boulevard Whitestone, NY 11357

GILSANZ MURRAY STEFICEK, LLP 129 West 27th Street 5th Flr New York, NY 10001

GOLDSTEIN ASSOCIATES CONSULTING ENGINEERS, PLLC 31 West 27th Street New York, NY 10001

GRACE INDUSTRIES, INC. 151-21 6th Road Whitestone, NY 11357-1206

HALLEN WELDING SERVICE, INC. 45-24 37th Street Long Island City, NY 11101

HELMSMAN MANGEMENT SERVICES, INC. C/O CORPORATION SYSTEM 111 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10011

HGC CONTRACTING CORP 5201 Flushing Ave Brooklyn, NY 11237

HIGH-RISE ELECTRIC, INC., 55 W. 58th Street New York, NY 10019

HIGH-RISE HOISTING AND SCAFFOLDING, INC 2820 Borden Avenue Long Island City, NY 11101

JP EQUIPMENT RENTAL MATERIALS, INC., 140 GRAND STREET, SUITE 501 WHITE PLAINS, NY 10601

LAQUILA CONSTRUCTION INC 1590 Troy Avenue Brooklyn, NY 11234

LASTRADA GENERAL

SILVERSTEIN PROPERTIES

New York, New York 10036

530 Fifth Avenue-18 Floor New York, New York 10036

SILVERSTEIN WTC FACILITY MANAGER LLC 530 Fifth Avenue-18 Floor New York, New York 10036

SILVERSTEIN WTC LLC 530 Fifth Avenue-18 Floor New York, New York 10036

SILVERSTEIN WTC MGMT CO LLC 530 Fifth Avenue-18 Floor New York, New York 10036

SILVERSTEIN WTC PROPERTIES LLC 530 Fifth Avenue-18 Floor New York, New York 10036

SIMPSON GUMPERTZ & HEGER INC C/O NATIONAL REGISTERED AGENTS, INC., 875 Avenue of the Americas, Suite 501 New York, NY 10001

SKIDMORE OWINGS & MERRILL LLP 14 Wall Street New York, NY 10005-2101

STAR DELTA ELECTRIC 17 Battery Pl., Room 203 New York, NY 10004

STIER ANDERSON LLC 30 Vreeland Drive Skillman NJ 08558

SURVIVAIR 3001 S SUSAN ST SANTA ANA, CA 92704

TISHMAN CONSTRUCTION CORPORATION OF MANHATTAN 666 Fifth Avenue New York, NY 10103

TISHMAN CONSTRUCTION CORPORATION

19 of 24

Case 1:06-cv-02892-ARHEREDOUGHNEHL354 Filed 04/12/05cwPlage XV at BOB

BREEZE CARTING CORP 31 Bay Street Brooklyn, NY 11231

BREEZE NATIONAL, INC., 31 Bay Street Brooklyn, NY 11231

BRER-FOUR TRANSPORTATION CORP. 33 Hewitt Street Hicksville, NY 11801

BURO HAPPOLD CONSULTING ENGINEERS, P.C., 105 Chambers Street New York, NY 10007

C & D FIREPROFFING & PLASTERING CORP 48 Walnut Street New Rochelle NY 10801

C.B. CONTRACTING CORP 4118 Victory Blvd Staten Island, NY 10314

CANRON CONSTRUCTION CORP C/O CT CORPORATION SYSTEM 111 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10011

CANTOR SEINUK GROUP 228 East 45th Street New York, NY 10017

CERTIFIED FENCE CORP. 59 Grant Street Harrison New York 10528

CIVETTA-COUSINS JV, L.L.C 1100 East 156th Street Bronx, NY 10474

CLARCOR AIR FILTRATION
PRODUCTS, INC.
C/O CT CORPORATION SYSTEM
111 EIGHTH AVENUE
NEW YORK, NY 10011

COMPONENT ASSEMBLY SYSTEMS, INC., 620 Fifth Avenue Pelham NY 10803 LESLIE E. ROBERTSON
ASSOCIATES CONSULTING
ENGINEER P.C.
170 Hamilton Avenue
White Plains, NY 10601

LIBERTY MUTUAL INSURANCE COMPANY 1818 MARKET STREET PHILADELPHIA, PA 19103

LIBERTY MUTUAL INSURANCE COMPANY 630 MORRISON ROAD SUITE 300 GAHANNA, OH 43230

LIBERTY MUTUAL INSURANCE COMPANY 3850 NORTH CAUSEWAY BOULEVARD SUITE 600 METAIRIE, LA 70002

LIBERTY MUTUAL INSURANCE COMPANY 165 DARTMOUTH STREET BOSTON, MA 02116

LIBERTY MUTUAL MANAGED CARE, INC., C/O CT CORPORATION SYSTEM 111 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10011

LOCK WOOD KESSLER & BARTLETT, INC. One Aerial Way Syosset, New York 11791

LUCIUS PITKIN, INC 50 Hudson Street New York, NY 10013-3389

LZA TECH-DIV OF THORTON TOMASETTI 641 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10011

MANAFORT BROTHERS, INC. C/O CT CORPORATION SYSTEM 111 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10011

MAZZOCCHI WRECKING, INC. C/O CT CORPORATION SYSTEM TISHMAN SPEYER PROPERTIES, 666 5TH AVENUE, 12TH FLOOR NEW YORK, NY 10103

TOMASETTI GROUP 641 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10011

TORRETTA TRUCKING, INC 120 MOUNTAINVIEW AVENUE STATEN ISLAND, NY 10314

TOTAL SAFETY CONSULTING, L.L.C C/O THELLC 5 Court Square Long Island City, NY 11101

TUCCI EQUIPMENT RENTAL CORP 3495 Rombouts Avenue Bronx, NY 10475

TULLY CONSTRUCTION CO., INC. 127-50 Northern Blvd
Flushing, NY 11368
Orc/o Mound Cotton Wollan & Greengrass
One Battery Park Plaza
New York, NY 10004

TULLY CONSTRUCTION COMPANY 127-50 Northern Blvd Flushing, NY 11368 Orc/o Mound Cotton Wollan & Greengrass One Battery Park Plaza New York, NY 10004

TULLY ENVIRONMENTAL INC. 127-50 Northern Blvd Flushing, NY 11368

TULLY INDUSTRIES, INC., 127-50 Northern Blvd Flushing, NY 11368 Orc/o Mound Cotton Wollan & Greengrass One Battery Park Plaza New York, NY 10004

TURNER CONSTRUCTION CO. 375 Hudson Street
New York, NY 10014

COMPANY ONS: 1:06-cv-02892-AKH Document 1 Filed 04/12/0675 Page 28 of 31 4 Irving Place MENT BROS. IRON WORKS CO., New York, NY 10014

New York, New York 10003

CONSOLIDATED EDISON COMPANY OF NEW YORK, INC., 4 Irving Place New York, New York 10003

CONSOLIDATED EDISON DEVELOPMENT, INC., 4 Irving Place New York, New York 10003

CONSOLIDATED EDISON ENERGY, INC., 4 Irving Place New York, New York 10003

CONSOLIDATED EDISON SOLUTIONS, INC., 4 Irving Place New York, New York 10003

CONSOLIDATED EDISON, INC., 4 Irving Place New York, New York 10003

CONSULTING ENGINEERS, P.C.

COORDINATED METALS, INC., 626 16th Street Carlstadt, NJ 07072

CORD CONTRACTING CO., INC 213 Roslyn Road Roslyn Height, NY 11577

CRAIG TEST BORING COMPANY INC. PO Box 427 Mays Landing, NJ 08330

CRITICOM INTERNATIONAL CORPORATION 99 Pine Street, 3rd Floor Albany, NY 12207

CUSHMAN & WAKEFIELD, INC, C/O CORPORATION SYSTEM 111 EIGHTH AVENUE NEW YORK, NY 10006

D'ONOFRIO GENERAL CONTRACTORS CORP 202 28th Street MENT BROS. IRON WORKS CO., INC., 150 West 22nd Street New York, NY 10011

MERIDIAN CONSTRUCTION CORP. 29 Grasmere Court Staten Island, NY 10305

MOODY'S INVESTORS SERVICE, C/O CT CORPORATION SYSTEM 111 8TH AVENUE NEW YORK, NY 10011

MRA ENGINEERING P.C., 600 Hempstead Tumpike West Hempstead, NY 11552-1036

MUESER RUTLEDGE CONSULTING ENGINEERS 225 West 34th Street New York, NY 10122

MUSCO SPORTS LIGHTING, LLC C/O CT CORPORATION SYSTEM 111 Eighth Avenue
New York, NY 10011

NACIREMA INDUSTRIES INCORPORATED 211 West 5th Street Bayonne, NJ 07002

NEW YORK CRANE & EQUIPMENT CORP. Brooklyn Navy Yard Brooklyn, NY 11205

NICHOLSON CONSTRUCTION COMPANY C/O CT CORPORATION SYSTEM 111 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10011

NYC INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY C/O SILVERSTEIN PROPERTIES 530 FIFTH AVENUE-18TH FLOOR NEW YORK, NY 10036

OLYMPIC PLUMBING & HEATING CORP COOPERMAN LEVITT & WINIKOFF, P.C.

TURNER CONSTRUCTION INTERNATIONAL, LLC.

INTERNATIONAL, LLC. 375 Hudson Street New York, NY 10014

ULTIMATE DEMOLITIONS/CS HAULING 500 New Street Oceanside, NY 11572

UNITED STATES REBAR, INC., 332 N. Main Street Freeport, NY 11520

VOLLMER ASSOCIATES LLP 50 West 23rd Street New York, NY 10010

W HARRIS & SONS INC 37 West Washington Avenue Pearl River, NY 10965

WEEKS MARINE, INC. 4 Commerce Drive Cranford, NJ 07016

WEIDLINGER ASSOCIATES, CONSULTING ENGINEERS, P.C., 375 Hudson Street, 12th Floor New York, NY 10014

WESTFIELD AMERICA, INC. 11601 Wilshire Boulevard Los Angeles, CA 90025

WESTFIELD WTC HOLDING LLC. C/O CT Corporation System 111 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10011

WESTFIELD WTC, LLC C/O CT Corporation System 111 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10011

WFP TOWER D. Co., LP, 222 BROADWAY NEW YORK, NY 10006

WHITNEY CONTRACTING INC. 636 Saw Mill River Road Yonkers, NY 10701

DAKOTA DEMOTEGIA-CV-02892-140 Old Northport Road Kings Park, NY 11754

DCM ERECTORS, INC 110 E. 42rd Street, Ste 1710 New York, NY 10017

DIAMOND POINT EXCAVATING CORP c/o ELIZABETH L. CROZZOLI 134-32 57th Avenue Flushing, NY 11355

DIEGO CONSTRUCTION, INC. C/O BUCKLEY TREACY SCHAFFEL MACKEY ABBATE & MOORE, ESQS 1157 60th Street Brooklyn, NY 11209

DIVERSIFIED CARTING, INC. 28 Garfield Avenue Bayshore, NY 11706

DMT ENTERPRISE, INC. 255 Lake Avenue Yonkers, NY 10701

AKH Document 1 Filed 04/12/068 Court Street of the 2200 OVE ARUP & PARTNERS P.C., Brooklyn, NY 11241 155 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10013

PARSON GROUP 70 East 55th Street 5th Floor New York, NY 10022

PETER SCALAMANDRE & SONS, INC. 157 Albany Avenue Freeport, NY 11520

PINNACLE ENVIRONMENTAL CORP c/o Paul O'Brien 64-54 Maurice Avenue Maspeth, NY 11378

PLAZA CONSTRUCTION CORP. 140 Palma Drive New York, NY 10304

WORLD TRADE CENTER PROPERTIES LLC 530 Fifth Avenue-18 Floor New York, New York 10036

Brooklyn, NY 11241

YANNUZZI & SONS INC 56 Oakwood Avenue Orange, NJ 07050

YONKERS CONTRACTING COMPANY, INC., 969 Midland Avenue Yonkers NY 10704

YORK HUNTER CONSTRUCTION, LLC 107 Old Goshen Road South Seaville, NJ 08246

ZIGENFUSS DRILLING, INC., C/O CT CORPORATION SYSTEM\ 111 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10011

ATTORNEY VERIFICATION

CHRISTOPHER R. LOPALO, an attorney at law, duly admitted to practice in the Courts of the State of New York, affirms under the penalties of perjury that:

He is the attorney for the plaintiff(s) in the above-entitled action. That he has read the foregoing SUMMONS WITH NOTICE and knows the contents thereof, and upon information and belief, deponent believes the matters alleged therein to be true.

The reason this Verification is made by deponent and not by the plaintiff(s) is that the plaintiff(s) herein reside(s) in a county other than the one in which the plaintiff's attorneys maintain their office.

The source of deponent's information and the grounds of his belief are communication, papers, reports and investigation contained in the file.

DATED: New York, New York February 16, 2006

CHRISTOPHER R. LOPALO, Esq.

Index No. 1:06-cv-02892-AKH Document 1 Filed 04/12/06 Page 31 of 31

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF NEW YORK

Rosa Vivar (and Husband, Wilson Vivar), Plaintiff(s)

- against -

1 WORLD TRADE CENTER LLC, ET AL

	Defendant(s).				
	SU	MMONS	WITH NOT	ICE	=======================================
		A Office an 11	ttorneys for d Post Offic 5 Broadwa w York, Ne	IAN & NAP : Plaintiff(s) e Address, Te y - 12th Floo ew York 1000	r
	To Attorney(s) fo	or .			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
·	Service of a copy of the within is hereby admitted. Dated,				
== EASE TA	Attorney(s) fo); =====		======================================	
that duly OTICE that that that will the judge	OF ENTRY the within is a (ce entered in the off OF SETTLEME; an order oe presented for s es of the	ice of the o	clerk of the wi		t on 20 hin is a true copy one of the
withi on Date	n named Court, a d,	at 20	at	М.	
				Yours, etc.,	